Implementing Cataloging Cultural Objects in TMS: The Case of the Yale Center for British Art
House keeping info:

Plan:

- What is CCO and what is the role of standards?
- YCBA TMS-CCO concordance
- Nuts & bolts: YCBA implementation and rationale
- Shared metadata creation workflow/lessons learned
What is the CCO?

- *Cataloging Cultural Objects* (CCO) is a data content standard for describing works of material culture and their surrogates. While published in 2006 by the American Library Association (ALA) Editions, the standard has been shaped primarily by professionals associated with the visual resources and the museum community, with library and archival professionals serving in advisory roles.
Key concepts for understanding standards:

- **Data structure**: data fields organized into a record or other information object. The Categories for the Description of Works of Art, for example, defines individual data fields as well as a totality of fields which can be used to construct a record, and therefore can be called a data structure.

- **Data value standards**: controlled vocabularies, thesauri, controlled lists of terms and names, and folksonomies. They are the terms, names, and other values that are used to populate data structures. Examples include the Art & Architecture thesaurus, and the Thesaurus of Geographic Names.

- **Data content standards**: guidelines for the format and syntax of the data values that are used to populate metadata elements/fields.
Cataloging Cultural Objects:

• CCO specifically provides guidelines for:
  - selecting,
  - ordering,
  - and formatting data
  used to populate the data
  fields of catalog records

*Sir Jeffrey Amherst*

Sir Joshua Reynolds, 1723-1792
ca. 1768, oil on canvas, 30 x 25 inches (76.2 x 63.5 cm)
Paul Mellon Collection
Yale Center for British Art
B1981.25.522
What is the role of standards?

- Promotes good descriptive cataloging
- Reduces redundant efforts
- Promotes data sharing
- Enhances end-user access
YCBA TMS mapping to CDWA Lite+: Methodology:

• Data structure:
  ▫ CDWA Lite: minimum requirement
  ▫ Basic Online Description by Object Type

• Priorities:
  ▫ All paintings, all
  ▫ All sculptures, all
  ▫ Drawings, artist by order of importance
  ▫ Prints, artist by order of importance
YCBA TMS-CCO concordance:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CDWA Lite elements</th>
<th>TMS fields</th>
<th>CCO guidelines</th>
<th>Example of shared metadata creation workflow</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Title</strong>&lt;sup&gt;*&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Title(s)</td>
<td>Part 2, Chapter 1. Object Naming: Work Type/Title. pp.48-71. <strong>Required.</strong></td>
<td>A default title (not entered) is attributed by the Registrar when creating a new object record. It is each department’s responsibility to research and attribute the appropriate titles. Preferred titles can be changed per curator’s approval only; preferred title changes must be documented with the curator’s approval in the object file, and noted in the TMS Title Remarks field.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Titles, identifying phrases, or names given to a work of art, architecture, or material culture. For complex works, series, or collections, the title may refer to a discrete unit within the larger entity (a print from a series, a photograph in a collection, a panel from a fresco cycle, a building within a temple complex) or it may identify only the larger entity (series, collection, cycle) itself.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&lt;cdوالite:sourceTitle&gt;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Source of Title</strong>&lt;sup&gt;*&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The source for the title, generally a published source.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&lt;cdوالite:sourceTitle&gt;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Title Type</strong>&lt;sup&gt;*&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Remarks</td>
<td>Part 2, Chapter 1. Object Naming: Discussion: Title: p. 49; Terminology, Title: p. 52; Controlled Fields for Title Language and Source: p.71.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The kind of title or name assigned to a work.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&lt;cdوالite:titleType&gt;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Title Preference</strong>&lt;sup&gt;*&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Title Types</td>
<td>Part 2, Chapter 1. Object Naming: Discussion: Title Type: p.50; Rules for Title, Various Types of Works: pp. 60-62; Rules for Title Type: p. 69; Controlled Fields for Title Type: p.70.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Title Display Order</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CCO Key Principles:

• Follow the CCO rules. Make and enforce additional local rules.

• Use published controlled vocabularies. Create local authorities that are populated with terminology as well as local terms.

• Be consistent regarding capitalization, punctuation, and syntax. Avoid abbreviations.

• Cataloguing, classification, indexing and display are different but related things.
Cataloguers are asked to check that each object record has at least one title, since it is a required element per CCO.

When there is no title, following the CCO’s recommendation (p.52: 1.1.2.1.2), the YCBA’s own guideline is to consult the published scholarship about the work at hand and then the acquisition documentation.
Paintings and Sculpture

**Charles Lenox Cumming-Bruce in Turkish Dress**

*Charles Lenox Cumming*

*Charles Lenox Cumming-Bruce in `Syriac` Costume*

Andrew Geddes, 1783-1844

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title Type</th>
<th>Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Repository title</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Title**

Charles Lenox Cumming-Bruce in Turkish Dress

**Remarks**


- Active
- Displayed

**Display Order**

1
Cataloguers are asked to assign the title type *repository* and the rank order #1 to the TMS title that is active and displayed to flag it as the preferred title (p. 58: 1.2.2.1).
TITLE-Preferred Title

- Cataloguers may assign other appropriate title types to additional titles, following the title types derived from the CCO and appended by the curators (p. 60: 1.2.2.2.3).
TITLE-Title Types:

- Repository: Record any titles assigned to the work by the YCBA and preferred by the YCBA for use in publications and on online.

- Creator’s: assigned to the work by the creator or preferred by the creator, if known.

- Inscribed: If a work contains an inscription that was applied by the creator with the apparent purpose of giving it a title, record it as a title.

- Verso: Many objects in the YCBA collections are doubled sided (prints, album pages...) and are catalogued as one object with two related images. Even though it is conventional to display the recto of such objects first, the verso has an equal importance when one is concerned with the issue of title. Consequently, I propose to use the title type Verso. This will ensure that both titles are displayed in reports.

- Collective: Title of the group to which an object belongs such as the title of a portfolio or series.

- Foreign language: Non-English language title.

- Former: Used for old titles that are no longer in use (attribution, identity of sitters or places represented have changed).

- Alternate: To record variant spellings and common misspellings. Never displayed to the end user.
TITLE-Capitalization and Syntax:

• Cataloguers are asked to verify the capitalization and syntax of the preferred title according to rules that follow CCO recommendations (p.58: 1.2.2.1).

• For titles derived from authoritative sources, follow the capitalization and punctuation of the source.

• For constructed titles in English, capitalize the first word of the title, nouns, pronouns, verbs, adverbs, adjectives, and subordinate conjunctions.
WORK TYPE-Specificity and Syntax

- CCO recommends using work types specific enough to
  1) identify the work for end users
  2) to serve local requirements for retrieval

- We follow the CCO recommended syntax: singular form and lowercase.

- Following one of the CCO’s key principles, we created our own controlled vocabulary for work type.
WORK TYPE (p. 54):

- **Work type for paintings**: *painting*

- **Work types for sculpture**:
  - *altarpiece* – a sculpture intended for liturgical use above an altar
  - *bozzetto/sketch* – a preliminary sketch for a finished work
  - *bust* – a head sculpted in the round which may also include shoulders and arms
  - *herm* – a bust that terminates and rests on a squared shape rather than a separate support
  - *high relief* – a relief where more than half the mass of the sculpture projects into space.
  - *low relief* – a relief where less than half the mass of the sculpture projects into space.
  - *medallion* – a largely flat, circular sculpture in relief
  - *misericord* – the projecting underside of a seat in the choir of a church
  - *model/modello/maquette* – a preparatory or presentation model more finished than a sketch
  - *overmantel* – an ornamental sculpture intended to be displayed over a mantelpiece
  - *statue* – a full sized, three-dimensional sculpture typically of the human figure
  - *statuette* – a small sized, three-dimensional sculpture typically of the human figure but also encompassing animals

- **For drawings**: *drawing* and any other terms that are not anywhere else in the record describing its physical form, function or media
Sir Isaac Newton
Unknown artist, after John Michael Rysbrack, 1694-1770,
Flemish, active in Britain from 1720
c. 1735, boxwood
Overall: 6 1/2 x 5 1/4 inches (16.5 x 13.3 cm)
Paul Mellon Collection, Yale Center for British Art, B1977.14.9
DATE: Specificity, Display & Indexing:

- Date of creation is a required element and recorded with the greatest level of specificity known (p.158).

- Date of creation is recorded in the display date field. The indexing fields record the span stated or implied in the display field (p.166).

*Tummel Bridge, Perthshire*
Joseph Mallord William Turner, 1775-1851, British between 1802 and 1803, oil on panel 11 3/8 x 18 3/8 inches (28.9 x 46.7 cm) Paul Mellon Collection, Yale Center for British Art B1976.7.162
DATE: Specificity, Display & Indexing:

- Events in the life of the object other than its main creation date are recorded and indexed in the Historical Dates fields (p.176).

*Dort or Dordrecht: The Dort Packet-Boat from Rotterdam Becalmed*

Joseph Mallord William Turner, 1775-1851, British
1818, oil on canvas, 62 x 92 inches (157.5 x 233.7 cm)
Paul Mellon Collection, Yale Center for British Art, B1977.14.77
DATE-Date Qualifiers:

- span indicating that a precise date is unknown, but the work was created at some point during the span (p.171).

- span that is known, during which the creation process took place over a number of years (p.171).
DATE-Date Qualifiers: controlled list:

- **after**: index with a 10-year span, or an appropriate span based on available information
- **before**: index with a 10-year span, or an appropriate span based on available information
- **ca.**: index with a -5 and +5-year span, or an appropriate span based on available information
- **decades**: indicate with a s after a year and index with a 10-year span, from 00 to 09.
- **early 1840s**: index as 1840-1843
- **mid-1840s**: index as 1844-1846
- **late 1840s**: index as 1847-1849
- **century**: index with a 99-year span
- **early 18th century**: index with a 29-year span, from 00 to 29
- **mid-18th century**: index with a 39-year span, from 30 to 69. Mid is always followed by a hyphen (-)
- **late 18th century**: index with a 29-year span, from 70 to 99
- **to**: Use to indicate when an object is worked on continuously over several years. For example, an object begun in 1770 and completed in 1775 would read: 1770 to 1775 (replaces the hyphen).
- **between ... and ...**: Use when a specific date of creation is not known, to indicate a span that contains some year or years when the work was made. For example, an object made somewhere between 1770 and 1775 would read: between 1770 and 1775. Replaces the forward slash (/).
- **or**: index with a multi-year span, as appropriate.
- **probably**: Do not use.
- **undated**:
  - Use **undated** if the date of an object is unknown. Index with the artist’s birth date plus 15 years and the artist’s death date (some artists might have started created earlier).
  - Use **undated, year range** if a date range other than the one deduced from the artist’s life dates is known or can be estimated. Index the estimated dates accordingly.
PERSONAL and CORPORATE NAME AUTHORITY

Authorized sources for creators’ names (p. 279)

- If sources disagree, go down the list of preferred sources and use the name in the first-listed source (p. 288).

- YCBA’s preferred source for artists’ names:
  - *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*

- Subsequent sources for artists’ names:
  - *Grove Art Online*
  - *Union List of Artist Names (ULAN)*
  - *Library of Congress Name Authority File*
As recommended by CCO, we distinguish between anonymous Creators and unknown creators: An anonymous creator is defined as one whose hand is identified and whose oeuvre is established, but whose name is not known (for example, Master of the Giants).
PERSONAL and CORPORATE NAME AUTHORITY - Capitalization for names with prefixes (p.286)

- Capitalize first, middle, and last names.

- Follow the authority source in determining whether or not to capitalize the prefix.

- If the name cannot be found in an authority source, use lower-case for the prefix (and enter it in the first name field), except for relatively modern names, when the prefix is considered to be part of the last name, in which case it is capitalized.
PERSONAL and CORPORATE NAME AUTHORITY -
Required Display Elements (p. 283)

- Record and index:
  - life dates
  - nationalities
  - places of birth, death, and activity
  - gender
  - life roles
PERSONAL and CORPORATE NAME AUTHORITY - Creators life date qualifiers

- **active**: Index as a 100-year span
- **born/died**
- **ca.**: Index as a 10-year span
- **centuries**:
  - **early 18th century**: Index as 1700 to 1729
  - **mid-18th century**: Index as 1730 to 1769
  - **late 18th century**: Index as 1770 to 1799
- **decades**:
  - **early 1840s**: index as 1840-1843
  - **mid-1840s**: index as 1844-1846
  - **late 1840s**: index as 1847-1849
- **no dates**: Not permitted since we can suggest dates of activity, even if general
- **Unknown creators**: An unknown creator refers to a situation where the oeuvre or hand of the artist is not established (e.g., unknown Florentine). Estimated life dates need not be entered for an unknown artist. Searches for these artists will be through the date of the object rather than the creator.
ATTRIBUTION QUALIFIERS (p. 94):

Required and controlled through Constituent Assistant Role drop down:

- **After:** An imitation or copy of a specific work by a named artist
- **Attributed to:** Likely to be by the artist but some minor uncertainty remains
- **Circle of:** An unknown artist associated with a named artist but not necessarily a pupil
- **Follower of:** A work close to a named artist's style and made within a generation of their death
- **Formerly:** for a former certain attribution
- **Formerly attributed to:** For a former (#2) uncertain attribution only
- **Imitator of:** A work by a later artist mimicking a named artist's style
- **Print by:** To describe any reproductive print. The type of print will be specified in the Technique sub-field (which is in the Medium field)
- **Pupil of:** A work by an artist working under the direction of a named artist though not necessarily within a studio
- **Studio of:** A work by an unknown artist taught or working under the direction of a named artist
- **Style of:** A work executed in a named artist's style by a contemporary
OBJECT RELATED ROLES (p. 96):

- Required and controlled via Constituent Assistant Display Prefix:

- All artists must have the controlled default object related role of “Artist”.

- When the creator’s role is apparent to the end user within the context of the display, the role will be omitted from the Creator display (i.e. Constituent Assistant Display Prefix field) all the while being indexed with the default role of Artist for all artists.

- Non artists’ object related roles must be chosen from the Role drop down:

- **Problem:** This field cannot **index** Object Related Roles and Attribution Qualifiers at once
• Required and not controlled

Jacques and the Wounded Stag: 'As You Like It,' Act II, Scene
Landscape by William Hodges, 1744-1797
figures by George Romney, 1734-1802
and stag possibly by Sawrey Gilpin, 1733-1807

Paul Mellon Fund, Yale Center for British Art, B1976.1.1

Cross-reference information
Entered the appropriate information about the object and constituent shown. When everything appears correct, click "Finish" to save all information.

Role
Artist
Display Prefix
Landscape by
Active attribution
Display Success
Display Order
1

Jacques and the Wounded Stag: 'As You Like It,' Act II, Scene
Landscape by William Hodges, 1744-1797
figures by George Romney, 1734-1802
and stag possibly by Sawrey Gilpin, 1733-1807
1790, oil on canvas, 36 1/4 x 48 1/2 inches (92.1 x 123.2 cm)
Paul Mellon Fund, Yale Center for British Art, B1976.1.1
MEDIUM - Syntax and Specificity

• Medium and support should be described as fully as possible.

• List multiple techniques or media in a logical order.

• Use of controlled terms from AAT thesaurus.

• All cataloguers of works on paper are trained by our Paper Conservation lab to be able to identify materials. Paintings’ media are identified by our Paintings Conservation lab.
SUPPORT MATERIALS-Syntax & Terminology:

- Record the thickness, texture, color, and type (wove or laid) of the paper in that specific order by referring to the Paper Sample Book published by the Print Council of America.

- Paper thickness terminology: thin, medium, moderately thick, thick, very thick.

- Paper texture terminology: very smooth, smooth, slightly textured, moderately textured, rough.

- Paper color terminology: light blue, blued white, bright white, white, cream, beige, brown.

- Paper type: laid, wove.
DIMENSIONS-
Primary Dimensions

- **For paintings:**
  - height and width of the unframed stretcher
  - height and width of the painted field element
  - height and width of framed dimensions

- **For drawings:**
  - height and width of the contemporary mount
  - height and width of the sheet
  - height and width of contemporary drawn border
  - height and width of the image

- **For prints:**
  - height and width of the sheet
  - height and width of the plate mark
  - height and width of the printed image

- **For sculptures:**
  - height and width overall
  - height and width of the base

---

*Dr. Syntax Sketching the Lake*
Thomas Rowlandson, 1756-1827, British
Watercolor with pen in red-brown ink over graphite, gold edge trimmed paper, with pen in maroon and brown ink lines on wove paper mount, on thick, matting board laid in mount
Sheet: 5 3/8 x 7 5/16 inches (13.7 x 18.6 cm)
Paul Mellon Collection, Yale Center for British Art, B1975.4.682
INSCRIPTIONS

• TMS Signed field:
  Signed and dated (or Signed or Dated): [It is unnecessary to state whether signature is in artist's hand] medium, location of signature (in full rather than abbreviated, e.g., lower left, not l.l., etc.): “date and/or signature”.

• TMS Inscriptions field:
  Inscribed, whether inscription is in artist’s hand, medium, location of inscription (in full): “inscription”.
**INSRIPTIONS - Location**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>upper left</th>
<th>upper center</th>
<th>upper right</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>center left</td>
<td></td>
<td>center</td>
<td>center right</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lower left</td>
<td>lower center</td>
<td>lower right</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SUBJECT TERMS

- Enter comma separated subject terms in the Notes field (Notes tab). Enter as many terms as necessary for describing the object at hand.

- Controlled: reuse shared keyword indexes of other museums (British Museum, Yale’s Lewis Walpole Library)

- Non-standard because iconography is crucial to historians of visual art and not handled well by Library of Congress Subject Headings.
SHARED METADATA CREATION WORKFLOWS

Registrar creates basic new object and constituent records

Record enrichment by curatorial department staff for CDWA Lite fields

Creation of descriptive texts (catalog entries, permanent collection wall labels, temporary exhibition labels) by curators

Editors

Review and approval of data by curators

Conservation

Creation of media records for digital surrogates

Copyrights management

Attribution of “public access” status to entire media record

Review and approval of data by collections catalog coordinator. Attribution of “public access” status to entire record

Review and approval by curators

YCBA Digital Library, cross-collections search engine, OAI-PMI server

Graphics department

YCBA Website, YCBA kiosks

Installation Team
LESSONS LEARNED

• Involve curators in the crafting of the cataloguing guidelines

• Revise and update the guidelines as the cataloguing is going on.

• Give content creators the possibility to review the cataloguing (eMuseum)
CONCLUSION

• Despite a few pitfalls, implementing CCO in TMS is well worth it because, as the last piece to fall in place in the matrix of metadata standards, CCO is poised to play a pivotal role in integrating descriptions of cultural objects across the domains of museums, libraries and archives.
Emmanuelle Delmas-Glass
Catalogue Specialist/Data Standards Administrator
Art Collections Information & Access
Yale Center for British Art
New Haven, CT
203-432-8454
emmanuelle.delmas-glass@yale.edu
www.yale.edu/ycba

Yale Center for British Art
Composite, Spring 2009
Photo credit: Richard Caspole, Yale Center for British Art
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Credit for front images

- **Portrait of a Lady**  
  Nicholas Hilliard, ca. 1547-1619, British  
  17th century, ca. 1605-1610  
  Watercolor and gouache on vellum laid down on card  
  2 x 1 11/16 inches (5.1 x 4.3 cm)  
  Paul Mellon Collection, Yale Center for British Art, B1974.2.51

- **Inverary Pier, Loch Fyne: Morning**  
  Joseph Mallord William Turner, 1775-1851, British  
  ca. 1845, oil on canvas, 36 x 48 inches (91.4 x 121.9 cm)  
  Paul Mellon Collection, Yale Center for British Art, B1977.14.79

- **Queen Victoria on Horseback**  
  Thomas Thornycroft, 1815-1885, British  
  1853, bronze, overall: 21 1/4 x 26 1/2 x 7 1/2 inches (54 x 67.3 x 19.1 cm)  
  Paul Mellon Collection, Yale Center for British Art, B2001.2.360